ANTI-LESBIAN, GAY, BISEXUAL AND TRANSGENDER VIOLENCE IN 1998

A Report of the
National Coalition of Anti-Violence Programs
ANTI-LESBIAN, GAY, BISEXUAL AND TRANSGENDER VIOLENCE IN 1998
# Table of Contents

**Executive Summary** ................................................................. 1  
  - Highlights of Findings ......................................................... 1  
  - Summary of Recommendations ................................................. 2  

**Part 1. About This Report** .......................................................... 4  
  - Introduction: An Epidemic of Violence ........................................ 4  
  - What This Report is Not .......................................................... 4  
  - Definitions of Bias Crime ....................................................... 6  
  - Methodology for Gathering and Reporting Information .................... 7  
  - Organization of Presentation .................................................. 8  

**Part 2. Data, Trends, and Analysis** .............................................. 9  
  - Section 1. Incidents .............................................................. 9  
    - Total Number of Incidents .................................................. 9  
    - Murders .............................................................................. 10  
    - Assaults and Attempted Assaults .......................................... 11  
    - Harassment and Intimidation .............................................. 14  
    - Other Categories ............................................................. 14  
  - Section 2. Offenders ............................................................... 16  
  - Section 3. Victims ................................................................. 18  
  - Section 4. Reporting and Police Response ................................... 21  
    - Introduction ....................................................................... 21  
    - Reporting ........................................................................... 21  
    - Police Response ................................................................... 23

**Part 3. National Recommendations** .............................................. 25

**Part 4. Local Summaries** .............................................................. 29  
  - Central Coast (CA) ................................................................. 30  
  - Cleveland (OH) ...................................................................... 31  
  - Colorado ................................................................................. 32  
  - Columbus (OH) ...................................................................... 33  
  - Detroit (MI) ............................................................................ 34  
  - El Paso (TX) ........................................................................... 35  
  - Houston (TX) ......................................................................... 36  
  - Los Angeles (CA) ................................................................. 37  
  - Massachusetts ...................................................................... 38  
  - Minnesota .............................................................................. 39  
  - New York City (NY) ............................................................... 40  
  - Orlando (FL) .......................................................................... 41  
  - Providence (RI) ...................................................................... 42  
  - St. Louis (MO) ......................................................................... 43  
  - San Diego (CA) ...................................................................... 44  
  - San Francisco (CA) ............................................................... 45

**Supplement 1: Case Intake/Incident Tracking Form** .......................... 47

**Supplement 2: Comprehensive Data** ................................................ 53
EX E C U T I V E S U M M A R Y

This is a report summarizing known incidents of violence that occurred throughout 1998 against lesbian, gay, bisexual and transgender (LGBT) individuals in 16 distinct cities, states and/or regions across the United States. Its author is the National Coalition of Anti-Violence Programs (NCAVP), a voluntary network of 26 community-based organizations and programs that monitor and respond to anti-gay violence1 within several cities, states and regions across the country.

Highlights of Findings

16 of NCAVP's 26 member agencies identified and reported the incidents of anti-gay violence summarized in this report. With reference to data gathered by the same 16 agencies in 1997, there was a modest decline in 1998 in the total number of reported anti-gay incidents, from 2,665 in 1997 to 2,552 in 1998 (minus 4%). Comparable reductions were noted in the total reported numbers of victims, offenders and crimes/offense comprising each incident.

The distribution of this reduction was not, however, general— the number of reporting agencies that documented increases in anti-gay violence in 1998 was equal to the number that reported decreases. Moreover, of the smaller total number of incidents that occurred, a larger proportion grew in 1998 to encompass more serious and even extreme levels of violence. For example:

• The number of actual or suspected anti-gay murders in the reporting cities, states and regions skyrocketed by 136%, from 14 in 1997 to 33 in 1998.
• Serious assaults (ones in which victims sustained major injuries) grew by 12%, despite a 11% decline in the number of assaults generally. Reported victim inpatient hospitalizations rose by 108%.
• The number of weapons reported in conjunction with assaults grew at an unprecedented pace. Reports of firearms increased by 71%; bats, clubs and blunt objects by 47%; vehicles by 150%; ropes and restraints by 133%; and knives and sharp objects by 13%. Reports of weapons in only weapons category declined, for objects that are typically thrown.
• Reported instances of verbal harassment and intimidation, the least serious offenses against persons monitored by NCAVP, dropped by much larger percentages than the decline in incidents overall, a further indication of the relatively greater violence accompanying a larger proportion of anti-gay acts.

1: As used in this report, the term "anti-gay violence" is inclusive of violence against all LGBT individuals.

1997-1998 TRENDS SUMMARY

Italicized categories are tracked by NCAVP only in connection with other violent crimes/offenses, and should not be interpreted to reflect general trends.

Total Incidents -4%

Murder +136%
Assault w/W eapon -17%
Attempted Assault w/W eapon N /C
Assault w/o Weapon -11%
Total Assaults/Attempted Assaults -11%
Intimidation -16%
Harassment -24%
Sexual Assault/Rape -2%
Abduction/Kidnapping -18%
Extortion/Blackmail -73%
Bomb Threat/Bombing -50%
Illegal Eviction +600%
Police Entrapment +10%
Unjustified Arrest -24%
Police Raid +88%
Discrimination -38%
Arson -11%
Vandalism +10%
Robbery -11%
Larceny/Burglary/Theft -28%
H IV/AIDS-Related -35%

Weapons Involved in Incidents +25%
Bats, clubs, blunt objects +47%
Bottles, bricks, rocks -15%
Firearms +71%
Knives & Sharp Objects +13%
Rope/Restraints +133%
Vehicle +150%
Other +17%
1997-1998 TRENDS SUMMARY

Incident Locations
- Police Precinct/Jail +1%
- Private Residence +1%
- Public Transportation +4%
- Street -16%
- Workplace -18%
- Public Accommodation -17%
- Cruising Area +3%
- School/College -26%
- LGBT Institution +7%
- In/Around LGBT Bar +1%
- LGBT Event +103%

Total Victims -9%

Extent of Injuries:
- Not injured -17%
- Minor injuries N/C
- Serious injuries +12%

Of Victims Injured, Medical Attention:
- Not required -7%
- Needed but not received -4%
- On outpatient basis +13%
- Hospital inpatient +108%

Total Offenders -12%

Acquaintance/Friend +9%
- Employer/Coworker -47%
- Ex-Lover +17%
- Landlord/Tenant/Neighbor -4%
- Law Enforcement Officer -4%
- Lover/Partner -50%
- Pick-Up -3%
- Relative/Family -1%
- Roommate +100%
- Security Force/Bouncer +44%
- Service Provider +21%
- Stranger +4%

Number of Offenders in Incidents:
- One +11%
- Two-Three -16%
- Four-Nine +18%
- Ten or More -19%

- The gender, racial/ethnic and other documented characteristics of both perpetrators and victims remained fairly constant in 1998, relative to 1997. Distinct increases were noted, however, in some less populous racial/ethnic categories, especially those comprising Arab/Middle Eastern and Asian-Pacific Islander individuals.
- There was a 242% increase in incidents reported to have been committed by hate groups.
- There was a 103% increase in incidents occurring at or near LGBT community public events, such as parades and rallies.
- Proportionately more acts were committed in 1998 by individuals who were relative strangers to their victims. The percentage in 1997 was 60%; in 1998, it grew to 65%.
- Police response to anti-gay violence deteriorated. While a much larger number of incidents were reported to police in 1998 than in 1997, rates of bias crime classification, arrest, and even the processing of complaints did not rise as much in consequence. Moreover, police raids and entrapment of LGBT individuals both increased substantially.
- In many instances, police further victimized LGBT individuals. Instances of verbal harassment and abuse of victims by police officers increased by 155%. Reports of physical abuse by police grew by more than 866%.

Summary of Recommendations

Though often depicted as such, acts of anti-gay violence are neither random nor chaotic. They are the predictable consequence of much more fundamental flaws in the nation's social, cultural and political fabric. For this reason, the problem of anti-gay violence cannot be resolved by the LGBT community, the government, the media, business leaders, religious organizations or any other single sector or group. There need to be dedicated and cooperative efforts by all of these and more to fashion strategies that understand and respond to anti-gay violence as an epidemic that is just as widespread, and as serious, as one of actual disease.

The following recommendations, if implemented, would approach this goal.

Recommendation 1
Foster a public, educational, political and cultural climate that makes clear that acts of anti-gay hatred and bias can have no part in a civil society. Specifically, schools should design and adopt general tolerance education curricula for youth; political leaders of every party should speak out forcefully against anti-gay discrimination and violence (and support genuine efforts to end it); businesses should establish and enforce appropriate LGBT tolerance and anti-discrimination standards for the workplace; religious leaders should make clear that no major religious tradition holds violence against any group to be an acceptable
tenet; and the media should explain and report about anti-gay violence in its larger context; i.e., as a broader pattern of occurrence that reflects and causes harm to every individual.

Recommendation 2
Commission a national study, as well as substantial independent ancillary research, of anti-gay and other hate-motivated violence, its prevalence and outcomes, and mandate participation in gathering and reporting relevant data by every political jurisdiction, down to the county level. Support the provision of, and include analyses of data from, community organizations that investigate and address related problems.

Recommendation 3
Criminalize hate-motivated behavior against LGBT individuals in the context of federal legislation, and authorize the Attorney General of the United States to investigate and prosecute such cases to the fullest extent.

Recommendation 4
Further penalize violence against lesbians, gay men and other targets of hate crimes at the state level by passing hate crimes bills to deter such acts and to provide stiffer penalties for those who commit them. To encourage these new laws, the federal government should enact legislation to provide enhanced law enforcement and criminal justice funding to the states that pass them.

Recommendation 5
Fund LGBT community-based anti-violence organizations, and other work at the community level, to deter acts of violence against LGBT individuals and to help these agencies build cooperative relationships with a wider range of partners.

Recommendation 6
Recruit and hire more openly LGBT police officers at all levels of law enforcement. Establish and promote anti-bias units in every metropolitan and state police force. Investigate and prosecute acts of harassment, intimidation and abuse committed by police officers against LGBT individuals.

1997-1998 TRENDS SUMMARY

Incidents Reported to Police: +39%

Of Incidents Reported to Police, Complaint Was:
- Refused: +74%
- Taken/No Arrest: +33%
- Taken/Arrest: +33%

Bias Classifications by Police:
- Classified as bias: +34%
- Bias classification refused: +77%
- Classification pending: +35%
- Classification unavailable: +136%
- Not reported as bias: +14%

Police Response to Victims:
- Courteous: +57%
- Indifferent: +34%
- Verbally abusive/no slurs: +141%
- Verbally abusive/slurs: +180%
- Physical abuse/no slurs: +2300%
- Physical abuse/slurs: +580%

Not Reported to Police: -38%
PART 1. ABOUT THIS REPORT

Introduction: An Epidemic of Violence

This is a report about the growing epidemic of violence against lesbian, gay, bisexual, and transgender (LGBT) individuals in the United States. It has been issued by the National Coalition of Anti-Violence Programs (NCAVP), a voluntary network of 26 community-based organizations that monitor and respond to anti-LGBT violence within several cities, states and regions across the country. This is the fifth such report issued by NCAVP in as many years.

The usage of the word “epidemic” to characterize the sum of the information discussed in this report is not casual. Nor is it intended to mitigate the culpability of those individuals and groups who perpetrate crimes that are rooted in hate. The word “epidemic” derives from Greek roots, *epi* (among) and *demos* (the people). Its meaning has come to embrace any broad, sustained and harmful pattern of disturbance that has identifiable causes and predictable outcomes. Moreover, although it may seem to be one or both in the particular instances in which it occurs, an epidemic is neither random nor chaotic. Viewed as a larger-scale phenomenon, it has discernible depth and breadth; evolves in particular ways; and enlarges or diminishes according to its own logical antecedents.

Violence against LGBT individuals in the United States is just such a phenomenon, and this fifth year of reporting by NCAVP presents the best overview to date of the larger-scale circumstances associated with its occurrence. But unlike most epidemics of actual disease, the one of anti-gay violence (a term that is inclusive of violence against all LGBT individuals) is not adequately monitored or reported by any government agency. Hardly any meaningful research is underway to investigate it, and there is no national strategy to prevent its growth or redress its effects. On the contrary, Americans learn and think about the epidemic of anti-gay violence (if at all) as something quite its opposite: a collection of random and isolated events, which no broader-scale strategies can address.

The results of these deficiencies are several, and they are not experienced by LGBT individuals alone. If it is accepted that violence of any kind strikes at the foundation of a civil society, then violence affecting a particular group of individuals must increase the injury a hundredfold. When such acts occur, it is not overstatement to suggest that the life of an entire community is made poorer in consequence— or that an entire nation bears responsibility for bringing them to an end.

What This Report Is Not

This report is not a complete characterization of the incidence of anti-gay violence in the United States. Such a report is not possible to obtain at this time.
Why not? For one, NCAVP lacks sufficient member organizations and resources to collect data on a truly national scale. There is probably no better way to illustrate this point than to note that the widely reported kidnapping, torture and murder of Matthew Shepard, a 21-year-old gay college student in October, 1998, is not referenced in any of the statistics included in this report. That is because NCAVP has no member organizations that monitor or respond to anti-gay violence in Wyoming, the state in which Mr. Shepard’s murder occurred.

Further, even within NCAVP, the capacity to collect and compile data for inclusion in this report is not uniform. This year, funding cuts and other resource and staffing concerns eliminated the inclusion of data that had formerly been collected by NCAVP member agencies in Chicago, IL; the District of Columbia; Phoenix, AZ and Virginia. The reports of five other agencies, however, are incorporated within this report for the first time this year. They represent Houston, TX; Minnesota; Orlando, FL; Providence, RI; and San Diego, CA.

In some instances, the regions monitored and served by NCAVP members coincide with political jurisdictions that also report violence against LGBT individuals. In this report, as in its past editions, the differences between the numbers of cases identified by NCAVP, versus those reported by local or regional law enforcement, are likely to be considerable. Some may even be led thereby to conclude that NCAVP’s numbers are inflated relative to the latter.

Actually, there are sound reasons underlying these differences, and they will be discussed in a number of relevant sections below. One of the primary reasons is that NCAVP relies on the direct reports of victims, whereas most of the “official” numbers reflect at least some additional layers of legal or administrative abstraction. In many cases, persuading law enforcement authorities to categorize even the most brutal acts of anti-gay violence as true “bias crimes”— even in jurisdictions...
NCAVP MEMBER ORGANIZATIONS (continued)

KENTUCKY
Gay & Lesbian Services Organization
Box 11471
Lexington, KY 40575-1471
TEL (606) 257-3530

MASSACHUSETTS
Fenway Community Health Center
Violence Recovery Program
7 Haviland Street
Boston, MA 02115
TEL (617) 267-0900
FAX (617) 267-3667

MICHIGAN
Triangle Foundation
19641 West Seven Mile Rd.
Detroit, MI 48219
TEL (313) 537-3323
FAX (313) 537-3379

MINNESOTA
Gay & Lesbian Community Action Council
310 East 38 Street, Suite 204
Minneapolis, MN 55409
TEL (800) 800-0127 hotline
FAX (612) 822-8766

MISSOURI
St. Louis Lesbian & Gay Anti-Violence Project
c/o University of Missouri
Department of Psychology
St. Louis, MO 63121
TEL (314) 826-7067 hotline
FAX (314) 516-5392

NEW YORK
New York City Gay & Lesbian Anti-Violence Project
240 West 35th Street, 200
New York, NY 10001
TEL 212-714-1141 hotline
FAX 212-714-2627

NORTH CAROLINA
North Carolina Coalition for Gay & Lesbian Equality

OHIO
Buckeye Region Anti-Violence Organization
P.O. Box 82068
Columbus, OH 43202
TEL (614) 268-9622
FAX (614) 262-9264

Prerequisites for Inclusion in This Report

To have local/regional data included within this report, an NCAVP member agency must employ NCAVP’s common Case Intake/Incident Tracking Form to record all incidents of anti-gay violence. It must further report such information internally to NCAVP for at least three consecutive years, to ensure the reliability of its data collection and reporting procedures and to provide benchmarks with which to perform minimal trend analysis.

Not all NCAVP member agencies can meet these conditions in every year. As a result, data and statistics cited in this year’s report cannot be compared to data and statistics cited in editions from any previous year. In other words, this report only presents same-city comparisons of data over two years, 1997 and 1998; NCAVP’s previously published reports presented such comparisons for different sets of cities, and different sets of years.

For more information on the Case Intake/Incident Tracking Form and the general methodology for recording and reporting incident information, see the appropriate section below.

Definitions of Bias Crime

The latter observation raises the question: What, in NCAVP’s view, is a bias-motivated act? More specifically, what kinds of bias-motivated violence commonly affect LGBT individuals?

For NCAVP, anti-gay violence encompasses all crimes and offenses in which victims are chosen by offenders solely or primarily because of the former’s actual or presumed sexual/affectional orientation or preference, gender identity and/or status. This definition includes more acts than are customarily addressed as such or even adequately recognized for their bias content by many law enforcement authorities. For example, from NCAVP’s point of view, anti-gay bias crimes include (but are not limited to) all of the following:

• Ordinary crimes, especially robberies, burglaries and thefts, if there is evidence that the perpetrator preys primarily or exclusively on LGBT individuals, or if bias-related motivation is apparent in the commission of the crime (as in the use of anti-gay slurs to address the victim).

• So-called “pick-up” crimes, in which the criminal and victim meet in a benign, consensual context, which the offender utilizes later to commit a criminal act. Many of the most heinous instances of anti-gay violence are of this type. (Had it classified Matthew Shepard’s murder, for example, NCAVP would have placed it in this category. That is because Mr. Shepard’s alleged killers are reported to have met him in a bar, and feigned friendliness at first.)

• Sexual assaults and rapes, if these appear related to the victim’s sexual orientation, preference, gender identity or status.

• Unsolved murders of LGBT individuals generally, if these seem to have been committed by strangers without any apparent motivation. Other hallmarks of
hate-related murders include abduction and kidnapping; beating; torture; “overkill” (inflicting injuries well beyond the point necessary to result in a victim’s death) and even the perpetrator’s own attempts to draw attention to the act from other LGBT individuals.

- Crimes, such as vandalism, against personal property, when bias-related motivation is apparent.
- Similarly, crimes against LGBT community organizations.
- Harassment and intimidation. Definitions of the latter are particularly susceptible to variation across political jurisdictions; NCAVP has adopted its own, generalized definitions, which appear in the box above.

Methodology for Gathering and Reporting Information
Whenever alerted (in most cases, by a victim) about the incidence of anti-gay violence, NCAVP member agencies collect relevant data on a common Case Intake/Incident Tracking Form (reproduced in Supplement 1). All of the numbers and statistics cited in this report are derived from entries that were made throughout the course of 1997 and 1998 on individual copies of this form.

Because the Case Intake/Incident Tracking Form is designed to summarize what is understood about an incident of anti-gay violence at a particular moment in time, it is not a perfect nor even a very comprehensive vehicle for recording everything else one might wish to learn about that incident. For example, several of the details documented on the form—Has the victim sought medical attention? Was the incident reported to police?—are changeable over time, but are in a majority of cases reported only as they appeared at intake. Physical injuries that take longer to become apparent, outcomes that include permanent disability, and the occurrence of longer-term mental and emotional distress are not readily discernible from the form entries, either. With reference to offender information, this, too, can be sparser at intake than at later times, especially in the cases of the most serious crimes. Finally, some survivors of anti-gay violence, even if not physically injured, are still so greatly traumatized by their experiences (or afraid of the potential consequences of reporting them) that they are never able to provide very detailed incident descriptions.

While the forms used by NCAVP’s member agencies are the same, those responsible for completing them, and each agency’s methods for compiling and analyzing the data are different. NCAVP staff have therefore developed uniform procedures for completing the forms, as well as for using the information contained in them to present their findings.

NCAVP MEMBER ORGANIZATIONS (continued)

OHIO (cont.)
The Lesbian/Gay Community Center
1418 West 29th Street
Cleveland, OH 44113
TEL (216) 522-1999
FAX (216) 522-0025

RHODE ISLAND
Rhode Island Alliance for Lesbian and Gay Civil Rights
P.O. Box 5758
Weybosset Station
Providence, RI 02903
TEL (401) 272-3247
FAX (401) 273-0540

TEXAS
Houston Gay/Lesbian Caucus
P.O. Box 6664
Houston, TX 77266
TEL (713) 521-1000
FAX (713) 526-4367

Lambda Services
P.O. Box 31321
El Paso, TX 79931
TEL (800) 616-HATE

VIRGINIA
Virginians for Justice
P.O. Box 342
Capitol Station
Richmond, VA 23202
TEL (800) 258-7842 hotline
FAX (804) 643-2050

UTAH
Anti-Violence Project
P.O. Box 521598
Salt Lake City, UT 84070
TEL (801) 297-4004 hotline

Anti-LGBT Violence in 1998
INCIDENT NARRATIVES

Several of the reporting NCAVP organizations submitted individual incident narratives along with aggregate incident data. These are reproduced on the succeeding pages to provide a better indication of the scope and diversity of anti-gay violence, as well as its effects on victims. The name of the city at the end of each narrative indicates the location of the NCAVP organization that provided it, not necessarily where the incident occurred.

Subsequent to attending a local gay pride celebration, a multiracial lesbian couple holding hands was assaulted by two unidentified males in the street. The perpetrators fled when the women screamed to an onlooker to call 911. Police officers, upon arriving at the scene, offered the victims no medical assistance and declined to take photographs of their injuries. A few made anti-gay remarks. The perpetrators were later apprehended, but prior to the local AVP’s intervention, charged only with public drunkenness. (Los Angeles, CA)

Cathy, a 24-year-old white lesbian bartender in Brooklyn, was walking home from work when a group of young men began to taunt her, shouting “Hey, you fucking dyke!” When she began to run, she heard them say, “Hey dyke, come here!” The men chased after her and dragged her to the sidewalk. One of them pulled out a box-cutter and cut her leg. She was later treated and released from a nearby hospital. No suspects were arrested. (New York, NY)

A white gay male was walking home after work, immediately following the announcement of Matthew Shepard’s death. As he was reporting aggregate data, are not. NCAVP’s larger member agencies typically employ dedicated staff members to handle case intake on a 24-hour basis; the information they gather tends to be both comprehensive and reliable. In some of NCAVP’s smaller agencies, however, primary responsibility for completing case intake forms falls on the shoulders of committed volunteers, who typically have fewer immediate resources to bring to their work and a much wider range of competing program and administrative responsibilities.

While NCAVP utilizes a common training program and detailed procedure manual to ensure the overall integrity of the form data, problems nonetheless arise. NCAVP has compensated for these problems in this report by conducting a thorough review of individual form data, and adopting the most conservative alternative when more than one exists. For example, if a particular incident form reports that an individual was the victim of assault, but is silent about the extent of injuries, this report classifies that assault as one in which no injuries were sustained.

Organization of Presentation

The organization of this report is straightforward. Part 1, this section, describes this report and its manner of presentation. Part 2 presents an overview and analysis of national statistics and trends, and is divided into a number of relevant sections, while Part 3 itemizes NCAVP’s national recommendations for improving research, prevention, service, criminal justice, law enforcement and related strategies in response to Part 2 findings. Part 4 provides more detailed information about the data contributed to this report by each of the 16 local NCAVP members that participated in its composition this year. Various supplements contain additional useful information, including the complete set of aggregate local and national data forming the basis for this report.
PART 2. DATA, TRENDS AND ANALYSIS
Section 1. Incidents

As noted in the previous section, 16 NCAVP member organizations participated in collecting and compiling the data presented in this report. They recorded a total of 2,552 separate incidents of anti-gay violence in 1998—a decline of approximately 4% from the 2,665 incidents reported by the same organizations in 1997. These incidents affected a total of 2,896 victims, compared with 3,196 in 1997 (a decline of 9%). They were further categorized to include 4,552 distinct crimes and offenses, as opposed to 5,509 in the year before (a decline of 17%).

To the extent that this report contains good news, however, it ends here. As the ensuing analysis will make clear, the reductions in the overall numbers of anti-gay incidents, victims and crimes and offenses in 1998 were more than out-

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Total Number of Incidents</th>
<th>1997</th>
<th>1998</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total Number of Victims</td>
<td>2,655</td>
<td>2,552</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Number of Victims</td>
<td>3,196</td>
<td>2,896</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Number of Separate Crimes and Offenses</td>
<td>5,509</td>
<td>4,528</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As noted in the previous section, 16 NCAVP member organizations participated in collecting and compiling the data presented in this report. They recorded a total of 2,552 separate incidents of anti-gay violence in 1998—a decline of approximately 4% from the 2,665 incidents reported by the same organizations in 1997. These incidents affected a total of 2,896 victims, compared with 3,196 in 1997 (a decline of 9%). They were further categorized to include 4,552 distinct crimes and offenses, as opposed to 5,509 in the year before (a decline of 17%).

To the extent that this report contains good news, however, it ends here. As the ensuing analysis will make clear, the reductions in the overall numbers of anti-gay incidents, victims and crimes and offenses in 1998 were more than out-

A young male high school student was repeatedly harassed by fellow students because he is gay. He reported finding threatening and harassing notes, containing direct references to his sexual identity, in his locker and on the windshield of his car. On one occasion, he was hit by objects thrown at him while walking down a school corridor. The victim reported these incidents to school administrators, but the latter declined to take any action to address them. (El Paso, TX)

On Halloween night, individuals standing outside a lesbian and gay night club in Santa Barbara were taunted on three occasions by a car containing two unidentified young men. The latter shouted “faggot” and other epithets, and pelted the establishment and its patrons with eggs. (Central Coast, CA)
Gary Trzaska, a 41 year-old white gay male, was attacked and killed by at least four young assailants near the corner of Broadway and Titus Avenue in Buffalo, New York. As many as six people witnessed the murder and were “either unable or too afraid to stop it,” according to local press reports. Witnesses said the victim had stopped for a few beers at a bar, and was about to enter his car when the attackers surprised him. After knocking him to the ground with a chair, three attackers began to jump as high as they could over the victim’s head, landing on it with both feet. A fourth attacker, from a reported group of approximately 20 other young people across the street, ran across the road to kick the victim. Because the victim’s wallet was stolen during the incident, police classified the killing’s motive as robbery, even though $200 in cash remained in the victim’s pocket. Family and friends believe it was a hate crime, and have advocated for it to be investigated as such. William N. Nance, 16 years old, was subsequently arrested in connection with the incident and charged with 2nd degree murder. He told police that he and his friends had no particular reason to single out the victim. Anti-gay and potential racial bias (the assailants were African-American) have been alluded to in the local press. (New York, NY)

A 19 year-old African-American lesbian reported chronic harassment by a female neighbor, who repeatedly called the victim, “Lesbian, dyke, bisexual, bitch” as she entered and left her home. (St. Louis, MO)

weighed by the extreme violence accompanying a larger number of acts. Moreover, the decreases in violence reported in some areas were accompanied by new upsurges in several others. That is, only the Central Coast, Los Angeles, Massachusetts and San Diego reported significant reductions in the total number of incidents of anti-gay violence. Substantial increases occurred in many others, especially Cleveland (up 64%), Colorado (up 107%), Minnesota (up 16%), Orlando (up 100%) and Providence (up 40%). In all, the ratio of the number of cities, regions and states reporting decreased incidence to those reporting increased incidence was just 1:1.

With respect to the decreases, it is also important to note that the Massachusetts NCAVP member agency experienced a reduction in funding and program staff in 1998 that may have affected its ability to gather and report as much data as in the past. In particular, this organization was forced to end a program that predominantly served LGBT youth, who had accounted for a significant portion of its caseload in prior years. No attempts were made to correct for this and any other potential dampening factors in this report.

Murders

Murders, 1997 and 1998

That there is no rational cause to celebrate the overall decreased incidence of anti-gay violence in 1998 is demonstrated conclusively by the fact that an unprecedented 33 anti-gay murders were reported by NCAVP’s members last
year, compared with just 14 in 1997, for a staggering rate of increase of 136%. In fact, almost as many murders were reported by NCAVP members in 1998 as occurred in 1996 and 1997 combined. The nation’s murder rate generally, by contrast, has dropped to its lowest level in decades, a trend that continued to be evident in the FBI’s report of national crime trends during the first half of 1998.

NCAVP agencies reporting the highest rates of increase in murders included its members in Colorado (from 0 to 2), Detroit (from 2 to 6), New York (from 5 to 10), Orlando (from 0 to 3) and St. Louis (from 0 to 2). The truly national scope of the problem is further illustrated by the fact that just one of NCAVP’s member agencies, in Columbus, Ohio, reported a decline.

Finally (as the above figure shows), while murders provide tragic and sometimes very visible examples of anti-gay violence, they nonetheless represent a small portion of its incidence overall. Important to realize is that most anti-gay murders are the predictable consequences of much larger and less frequently recognized patterns of hate-motivated behavior. They are, in effect, “the tip of the iceberg;” just as alarming, and ultimately as dangerous, is what lies underneath.

Assaults and Attempted Assaults
NCAVP documented an 11% decrease in the total number of assaults and attempted assaults in 1998 (907), compared with those in 1997 (1,023). This decrease is roughly consistent with the reduction in assaults noted generally by the FBI in the first half of last year. Again, however, there is little if any cause for the LGBT community to breathe a sigh of relief.

A 21 year-old white gay male was found dead, run over by a car, in an incident police are investigated as bias-related. The night of the man’s death, witnesses indicated that he was harassed by two men in an anti-gay incident before he “disappeared” from a local bar. (St. Louis, MO)

Carol, 33 year-old pre-operative transgender Latina woman, was being processed into a drug/alcohol rehabilitation center in Manhattan. She was told by the center’s administrators that she would have to share a room with a man, because “anatomically,” she was “male.” During her intake, a male counselor escorted her to a men’s bathroom. When Carol protested, the counselor asked her, “What you think you got between your legs?” (New York, NY)

A 21 year-old white gay man reported anti-gay vandalism occurring at his home. Graffiti by the perpetrator(s) included “A cocklicker” and “Cumgobbler.” In addition, his yard was strewn with toilet paper, and his car was smeared with vaseline, shaving cream, and an unidentified substance that removed spots of paint. (St. Louis, MO)

A 21 year-old white lesbian reported being assaulted in a parking lot while she was traveling between two jobs, by a man who had followed her from the first one. At her first place of employment, the assailant said to the victim, “You look like my dyke ex-wife. Are you a lesbian?” She told him that she was not. When the man followed her into the parking lot of her second job, and saw rainbow stickers on her car, he said, “You lied to me. I hate liars. My wife has those
on her car." The man then approached the victim, struck her in the face, yanked her head up and kissed her, saying "I want to see what a woman tastes like from another woman's [sic] lips." He then tried to assault the victim sexually, but she fought back and subdued him before police arrived. (St. Louis, MO)

A 50 year-old woman was at home with her 28 year-old daughter and two young grandchildren when she heard a window smash. She went to the window and found that a brick had been thrown through it. The brick had the word "God" written on it. After calling police, the women went to her front porch and found that the rainbow flag outside her home had been set on fire. (Boston, MA)

A 30 year-old Latino gay man and his 28 year-old African-American male partner were travelling on the subway to their apartment in the Bronx, when they noticed three females making anti-gay comments in Spanish. The three women then approached the couple, called them "faggots" and sprayed water on them. Two of the attackers then spat on the victims and began to shove them. At this point, four young men joined the females in their attack. One of the victims was knocked to the floor of the subway and kicked repeatedly by the entire group as his partner tried to protect him. No one else in the subway car came to the couple’s aid. Later, the subway conductor told the victims that police officers would be waiting for them at the next station. The couple exited the train and waited half an hour for police, before walking to the police precinct to make a report. The crime was classified as a bias attack. (New York, NY)

First, the reduction in assaults was far from general. Almost half of NCAVP’s members reported increases in the number of assaults and attempted assaults occurring in their cities, states and/or regions.

Those with the highest rates of increase in assaults and attempted assaults included Cleveland (up 120%), Colorado (up 100%), Houston (up 500%), Orlando (up 125%) and Providence (up 250%). Those with the sharpest decreases were El Paso (down 53%), New York (down 23%) and San Diego (down 29%).

Second, the assaults that occurred in 1998 were considerably more violent than has ever been documented before—even in regions that reported the largest overall reductions in their total numbers. Information collected from victims shows that the number of serious injuries occurring as a consequence of assaults increased by 12% in 1998 relative to 1997. More alarming still, the number of inpatient hospitalizations occurring as a result of these assaults skyrocketed from 53 to 110—an increase of 108%. The incidence of outpatient treatment...
increased also, by 13%, while the number of assault victims reporting no injuries at all declined by 17%.

Further analysis of assault and attempted assault statistics reveals at least some of the probable reasons for these outcomes. Even though the number of assaults involving weapons declined in 1998 (along with assaults generally), considerably more weapons were documented in the ones that occurred. The increase in this case was 25% (Underreporting of weapons in Minnesota in 1997 may be accountable for some of this growth, but not more than one third).

Moreover, the classes of weapons employed in assaults appeared to grow far more dangerous. For example, the total number of firearms reported in conjunction with assaults increased by 71%; vehicles by 150%; bats, clubs and blunt weapons by 47%; and knives and other sharp objects by 13%. Reports of weapons in just one category declined, and that was for objects that are typically thrown (rocks, bottles, bricks, etc.). The latter are also the weapons most frequently employed when an assailant is not in close proximity to the victim, nor mounts more than a limited (and generally unpremeditated) attack. Again, past underreporting in specific weapons categories may have contributed to some of these increases, but cannot wholly account for them.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Weapons Involved in Incidents, 1997 and 1998</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bats, Clubs, Blunt Objects</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1997: 73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1998: 107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bottles, Bricks, Rocks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1997: 81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1998: 69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Firearms</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1997: 28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1998: 48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knives, Sharp Objects</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1997: 71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1998: 80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rope, Restraints</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1997: 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1998: 7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vehicles</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1997: 12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1998: 30</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A white male in his late 30's was roller-blading in a residential area of Houston when he was assaulted by two young men in their early 20s. The men called him “faggot” and “queer.” The victim lost an eye as the result of the attack. He said later, “My injury was so bad, sometimes I wish they would have just killed me. But I felt like they didn't want me to die...like living with only one eye would be a constant reminder of the attack and the control they had over me.” (Houston, TX)

A 31 year-old white gay male was assaulted by a 47 year-old white male neighbor when the latter came into the victim’s garage and hit him twelve times on the head with a baseball bat, saying “You are a faggot motherfucker who needs to move [out of this neighborhood]. If you don't move, you're gonna die.” The victim required 70 stitches and sustained a permanent head injury. As of February, 1999, the incident had still not been classified by police as bias-related. (St. Louis, MO).

A 34 year-old white gay male reported that a man running for Alderman had placed a sign in the park across from his home that read “Homos stay out of our park.” (St. Louis, MO)

Rufus Thomas, a thirty-five year-old African-American transgendered person, was found murdered in his apartment in the neighborhood of Allston. Sources report that he was stabbed twenty times in the chest. Police are conducting an investigation, but so far, no arrests have been made. (Boston, MA)

A 38 year-old white gay male reported being chased and
These figures clearly imply that while a lesser number of assaults occurred against gay and lesbian individuals in 1998 than in the past, the ones that did occur were far more serious, both in terms of the weapons used and the injuries sustained by victims. The increasing prevalence of these harder core assaults, combined with the skyrocketing murder rate documented earlier, indicates a net increase in the violence of anti-gay bias incidents that is truly disturbing for its intensity.

Harassment and Intimidation

The relatively more violent content of anti-gay bias during 1998 was also apparent in a sharp decline in the number of incidents involving harassment and intimidation, relative to the amount of the decline in the number of incidents overall. The total of reported incidents incorporating intimidation or harassment in 1998 was 1,680, down 24% from 1997's figure of 2,212. But even within these categories the trend proved to be toward incidents of increasing gravity, not less.

Expressed as a percentage of all the intimidation and harassment incidents in each year, the relatively more serious offense of intimidation actually became more commonplace in 1998 than before. Intimidation accounted for 53% of all intimidation and harassment cases reported in 1997; in 1998, it grew to encompass 59%.

Finally, as in the instances already cited, the overall decreases in intimidation and harassment were not uniformly distributed across the country. Substantial increases were reported in Cleveland (up by 78%), Colorado (up by 266%) and Providence (up by 55%). The largest decreases occurred in the Central Coast region of California (down by 74%), El Paso (down by 53%), Los Angeles (down by 20%), Massachusetts (down by 47%) and New York (down by 38%). Again, for reasons noted earlier, the absolute conclusions that may be drawn from the decrease in Massachusetts are uncertain.

Other Categories

The NCAVP agencies contributing to this report documented significant reductions in 1998, relative to 1997 figures, in several miscellaneous other categories of anti-gay violence, including kidnapping, extortion, blackmail, bomb threats, robberies, larcenies and thefts. The number of sexual assaults remained constant,
indicating that they increased as a proportion of total incidents. Vandalism, the most commonly reported hate crime against members of other targeted groups (but not historically a prominent feature of anti-gay violence), increased by 10%.

One very disturbing pattern of increase was noted with respect to police raids of gay and lesbian businesses and police entrapment of LGBT individuals. The former generally occur on the pretext of citing fire and building code, cabaret/club and/or liquor law violations; the latter in instances when police officers entice or proposition LGBT individuals and then arrest them on morals charges. Both of these practices enjoy a privileged place in the nation’s history of officially sanctioned discrimination against LGBT people; indeed, it was to protest one such incident of police harassment that the 1969 Stonewall Riot, which marked the beginning of the modern gay and lesbian civil rights movement, actually began.

The increases in these incidents are even more alarming, however, because in most areas of the country, police are often the only sources of assistance to which the victims of anti-gay violence can feasibly turn. If victims know or suspect that doing so may constitute an invitation to further harassment, intimidation or worse, then the prevalence of anti-gay violence in these areas cannot effectively be addressed. In this connection, it should be noted that a characteristic of many of those who commit offenses against LGBT individuals is that they believe their victims will never report their crimes, or that if they do, the police will “take their [the perpetrators’] side.” Sadly, in a growing number of cases, the criminals appear to be correct (see “Police Response,” below).

A substantial decrease was noted in 1998 in the number of anti-gay acts that were motivated in whole or in part by the victim’s actual or presumed HIV risk or status. However, because only a small number of NCAVP’s member organizations have dedicated HIV/AIDS anti-violence programs, and because patterns of anti-HIV violence appear to be changing in other ways (possibly as the result of police entrapment incidents, 1997 and 1998

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Incidents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1997</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1998</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A 37 year-old white gay male was assaulted by a man who hit him with vise grips as the victim was walking to a hotel where he was staying. The assailant yelled, “Faggot. Gay. Faggot. Queer.” His victim was hit in the face and back before he ran. The assailant chased the victim into the hotel lobby, where the victim pleaded with a desk clerk for help. The clerk refused to call police. The assailant then left the lobby, saying that he intended to retrieve a staple gun with which to assault the victim further. The victim forced his way into the desk clerk’s office and called police himself. Police arrested the perpetrator. (St. Louis, MO)

A disabled gay male, wearing freedom rings, was attacked by three young Latino men as all of them exited a public bus. Prior to the attack, the victim heard the perpetrators talking about how easy it was to “beat up a puto” (a Spanish word for “faggot.”). As the victim walked down the street from the bus stop, the attackers pushed him to the ground, punched and kicked him, and then fled. The victim declined to report the incident to police, but now suffers recurring nightmares. (El Paso, TX)

A 28 year-old white gay male, a college student, was shot in the chest and robbed outside a gay bar, one of 15 similar incidents recorded by local police within a period of three months. The victim survived with permanent injuries to his larynx, as well
improved survival and other shifts in the epidemic itself) the conclusions that can be drawn from this decrease are questionable.

Finally, there was a 103% increase in the number of incidents occurring in or around LGBT community events, especially parades and rallies. That such events would be more frequently targeted also seems to suggest a rising level of hostility accompanying many anti-gay acts, and perhaps even an increase in the number that are premeditated, as well.

Section 2. Offenders
Who commits acts of anti-gay violence?

Very little research has been accomplished or is even underway to throw light on this question. Some limited studies of convicted offenders have shown that they are likely to be young and male, and to have engaged in a serial pattern of offenses, each more violent than the last.

But such studies, even if more comprehensive, could actually tell us very little. For one, those caught and convicted of bias-motivated crimes against LGBT individuals (even putting aside the definition of those crimes) hardly comprise a random sample of all those who might commit them. Convicted offenders are the ones who were foolhardy, maladroit or unlucky enough to be caught and punished, subject to the additional vagaries of law enforcement, jurisprudence, and the quality of their legal representation. As such, it is in some ways only natural that they might also be more likely to have committed repeated crimes, or crimes of escalating seriousness.

Potentially more inclusive information about the perpetrators of anti-gay violence can be provided by their victims—even if, in individual instances, that information is sometimes less than reliable or complete. That such information in the aggregate still has important validity, however, is strongly supported by the fact that there is a remarkable degree of consistency in the sum of the offender information that victims reported to NCAVP, whether considered from year to year.
year or across the various member agencies that participated in compiling data for this report.

To summarize, in 1998, as in 1997, the great majority (86% vs. 85%, respectively) of the perpetrators of anti-gay violence were reported by their victims to be male (these and further percentages cited in the text and depicted in the accompanying figures were based on the cases in which offender information was known; that is, the numbers in the unknown categories were eliminated from the totals used to derive them). A substantial number of offenders were also reported to be young—45% in fact, were believed 22 years old or younger in 1998, and this, too, is the same figure reported for 1997. By contrast, 22% of perpetrators were thought to be 23-29 years of age, and 24% were believed to be 31-44 (the 1997 figures were 20% and 27%, respectively). In both years, the percentage of perpetrators reported to be older still was 9%.

As the graphs below illustrate, the race/ethnicity of offenders, as reported by victims, also underwent little change. In 1998, 50% were believed to be white, compared with 52% in the prior year; in both years, 21% were reported to be African-American and 22% Latino. More significant changes in certain less pop-
ulous racial/ethnic categories may indicate growing anti-gay intolerance in the communities they represent (and/or greater attempts at visibility by the LGBT individuals within them). The absolute reported numbers of Arab/Middle Eastern offenders, for example, grew by 65% last year, while reported Asian-Pacific Islander offenders grew by 17%.

With respect to the reported relationships of offenders to their victims, where known, there were some modest but intriguing changes in a few relevant categories. Greatly summarized, 1998 witnessed a small but meaningful increase in the percentage of incidents perpetrated by relative strangers (from 47% in 1997 to 52% in 1998), and a corresponding decrease in the percentage perpetrated by individuals who were known. Also interesting to note, but with uncertain implications, was an increase in the percentage of incidents committed by just one individual in 1998 (71%) versus that for 1997 (67%), and a roughly correspondent decrease in the number committed by small groups (defined as 2-3 individuals).

A very alarming increase was noted in 1998 in the number of offenses committed by hate groups, defined as identifiable associations of individuals that espouse a more or less organized agenda of anti-gay intolerance. A total of 12 such incidents were documented in 1997; the figure in 1998 rose by 242%, to 41.

Of course, in many instances, nothing is known about the perpetrators of anti-gay violence at all, either because the victim didn’t survive, cannot recall, fears reporting this information, or did not have a chance to observe offenders carefully. 1998 was notable for two very substantial increases in the number of these “unknowns,” specifically with respect to the estimated ages and numbers of offenders involved in individual incidents. Such an outcome is to be expected in connection with the greater violence accompanying many anti-gay attacks, but inasmuch as the largest amounts of these increases appear to have been confined to one city, New York, it is probable that intake error may be accountable in this instance, as well.

### Section 3.Victims

As in 1997, those most likely to report anti-gay violence in 1998 tended to be white, self-identified gay males between the ages of 22 and 44.

The reported number of women (excluding unknowns) victimized by anti-lesbian violence declined modestly in 1998, representing 25% of the total relative to 1997’s 28%. The percentage of male victims, 66%, remained about the same. Very
significant increases were noted in the number of transgender victims, however, for an increase in absolute numbers of 49%, and bringing them from 3% to 5% of 1998 victims overall.

With respect to the reported sexual identities of victims, the amount of change was largely insignificant. As in 1997, 85% of 1998’s victims about whom such information was reported identified themselves as gay or lesbian. In both years as well, 5% were bisexual; about 5% were heterosexual; and 2% were questioning or unsure. The absolute numbers of the latter, however, increased by 18% in 1998.

Equally minor changes were noted in 1998 in the relative ages of victims, where known, which continued to show that a large plurality (43%) were between 30 and 44. The proportion of victims in the under-18 group declined appreciably, from 7% to 4%, but a significant part of this reduction appears to have been an artifact of the elimination of a youth program in Massachusetts (the resultant reported decline in that state was from 57 under-18 cases in 1997 to just 5 in 1998). Studies nationally show that youth are among the most frequent victims of anti-gay violence, and so it is probably their status as youth, and consequent inability or unwillingness to seek assistance from adult, LGBT community orga-

Anti-LGBT Violence in 1998
organizations, that contributes to the relatively small number of under-18 victims reported to NCAVP. One interesting increase, of 10%, was noted in the number of victims between the ages of 45 and 64, who accounted for a 2% proportional increase, as well.

Few meaningful changes were noted in the race/ethnicity of victims in the cases in which either was known. In both 1998 and 1997, about 60% of victims were white, 12% African-American, and 16% Latino. Here, as in the section about offenders, there were two significant absolute number increases among Arab/Middle Eastern and Asian/Pacific Islander victims. Because these groups comprise such a small percentage of victims overall, however, their relative proportions in both years did not meaningfully change.

Finally, as in 1997, about 4% of the victims of anti-gay violence were LGBT community organizations— including some of the ones that participated in compiling the information included in this report.
Section 4. Reporting and Police Response

Introduction
The history of relations between the police and the LGBT community is a profoundly troubled one. Until very recently, and in some cases even today, most police departments were agents of many of the most brutal instances of officially sanctioned anti-gay oppression. Much of the work of NCAVP’s member organizations is to remediate this legacy— to make partnerships with the police that, if not exactly resulting in universal tolerance, are at least more productive than the mutually felt antagonisms that preceded them.

This work necessarily proceeds on two fronts. First, NCAVP members strive to educate the entire LGBT community about its rights and responsibilities with respect to law enforcement. Victims especially are encouraged to report anti-gay violence, no matter how seemingly insignificant, to the police, so that the latter can gain a better understanding of its extent and effects.

Second, NCAVP members work directly with the police themselves. They provide training and other resources; advocate for the bias classification, where available, of anti-gay crimes; act as a liaison to the police for the LGBT community as a whole; and work in a variety of ways, ranging from posting rewards to organizing grass roots advocacy, to ensure that a larger number of anti-gay crimes are investigated and solved.

In 1998, NCAVP performed the first part of this two-pronged strategy very well. Unfortunately, as the information presented later in this section will show, the police response to anti-gay violence still left much to be desired— and in a record number of cases, contributed to the problem.

Reporting
Critics of past versions of this report have compared the numbers of incidents it cites to the number of anti-gay bias crimes reported by police departments in various jurisdictions. Because the former numbers are usually much larger than the latter, they have implied that NCAVP’s figures are in some way inflated, if not fabricated outright.

Trends in case reporting are naturally susceptible to the extent of resources available in any given time or place to gather, analyze and communicate relevant information. This point has already been made in other parts of this report.

Other crucial factors, however, include the willingness of the victims of anti-gay violence to step forward— and to whom, in a given area, they feel they can turn. For a variety of reasons, more LGBT victims of violence will probably always report their experiences to their community’s own organizations, if possible, than to the police.

First, most isolated incidents of simple verbal harassment are so commonplace in the lives of many LGBT individuals that they are never reported at all— not even, in a probable majority of instances, to NCAVP’s own member organiza-
Jamaican gay man living in Greenwich Village, was found stabbed multiple times in his apartment on Christopher Street. The alleged perpetrator, whose relationship to the victim remains unknown, was arrested when he sought medical care for stab wounds to his leg at St. Vincent's Hospital. Early press coverage alleged that the victim was a “drag queen,” “into leather,” and an “S/M master.” (New York, NY)

On the evening of June 28, 1998, a 23-year-old African American male college student was approached by a group of four other males, who asked him if he was gay. The student responded that he was. Later that night, the student spotted the same group of men. They approached him again, shouting “Get the faggot” and other slurs, and threw sticks and bottles at him. One of the attackers caught up with the victim as he tried to flee, and beat him about the head with a 2x4. The victim stumbled into a nearby gas station and asked the attendant to call police. The attendant refused and told the victim to call police himself. Police arrived and took the victim to a hospital where he was treated and released with approximately 25 stitches to his head and multiple bruises. Despite police canvassing of the area, no suspects were found. (New York, NY)

Peter Garcia, a Latino gay male, was found with multiple stab wounds in a rented room in the Allerton Hotel in Chelsea, Manhattan. Peter had left the Limelight Disco on the night of August 10, 1998, around 2 am, with a man he had met there. Shortly after renting a room at the Hotel, Peter was stabbed by the man, who

Incidents Reported to Police, 1997 and 1998

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Incidents Reported to Police</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1997</td>
<td>728</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1998</td>
<td>1,010</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In 1998, these strategies created impressive new gains. According to NCAVP’s figures (and excluding cases in which this information was unrecorded), although the total number of anti-gay incidents declined last year in the ways described earlier, the actual numbers of victims’ reports and attempted reports to police climbed substantially, by 39%. In fact, incidents reported to police in 1998 represented 46% of all cases in which information about reporting was known, compared with just 33% one year earlier.

In addition, more than twice as many victims indicated their intention to report incidents to the police in the near future, if they hadn’t done so already. The latter percentage increase was 145%, and such cases grew as a percentage of known incidents from 5% in 1997 to 13% in 1998. All told, then, the number of known incidents documented already to have been reported to police by the victims at intake, or that victims promised to report to police soon after, climbed from 843 in 1997 to 1,292 in 1998: an increase of 53%.
NCAVP figures show that the increase in reporting greatly affected law enforcement, from the local to federal levels. How, then, did police respond?

In approximately 15% of cases—versus 12% in 1997—they refused to take the victim’s complaint at all. In an additional 67% of cases—down from 69% in 1997—they took the complaint, but made no arrest; and in 18% of cases—down from 19% in 1997—an arrest had been made at intake or shortly thereafter (Because of the limitations on NCAVP’s data collection that were described at the beginning of this report, figures for the longer range disposition of cases are not available).

1998 rates of bias crime classification did not keep pace with increased reporting by victims, either. The rate of increase for the former was 34%, compared with 37% for the latter, relative to 1997. In addition, the number of cases in which bias classification was available but refused climbed from 10% of known reported apparently fled the scene. A sketch of the perpetrator and the victim were widely circulated throughout the city. Many potential witnesses have been interviewed by police, and even the victim’s computer was analyzed for leads/evidence. One current lead in the case suggests a possible connection with the occurrence of the U.S. Navy’s "Fleet Week" in New York City at the time of the murder. (New York, NY)

Robert Hernandez Valles, 58, was found murdered in a northeast El Paso motel on Sunday, April 19. Valles was last seen leaving a local gay nightclub with two males, whom police believe he met there. Valles’ teal-colored 1996 Chevy Cavalier was found in Fort Bend, TX, just south of Houston, the following Tuesday, and a male matching a witness's description of one of the suspects was arrested shortly thereafter. (Houston, TX)

Two young white lesbians reported chronic harassment by their neighbors, who made obscene gestures and called them “dyke bitches” as they entered and left their house. (St. Louis, MO)

Upon leaving his job in Ventura, a 32-year-old Latino gay male noticed a small piece of paper attached to his windshield wiper. The handwritten note read, “Queers are only 1% of the population, according the New York Times. Queers infiltrated the American Psyche Assn (sic) in order to take over and declare homosexuality is not deviant, unnatural (sic), abnormal, etc. The vast majority of the American public knows the truth. The fag media lies. Adopting the beautiful rainbow as your emblem will...
cases in 1997 to 13% in 1998, and those in which bias classification was simply unavailable also climbed, by 136% in absolute numbers and from 7% to 11% of the total number of reported cases in each year.

Far more troubling than the unwillingness or inability of law enforcement to recognize instances of anti-gay bias, however, were many victims’ descriptions of their reception by police themselves. In short, there were very dramatic increases in 1998 in reports of verbal and/or physical abuse by police in response to victim’s attempts to report a bias crime.

In 1998, such instances accounted for an astonishing 20% of all the cases documented by NCAVP’s member to have been reported to police, versus just 9% in 1997. In other words, one in five victims of an anti-gay bias incident in 1998 who attempted to report it to police were treated to more of the same. Almost one in 14 became victims of actual (and in some cases, further) physical abuse. To make matters worse, the increases in these categories were general: in no city or region did the numbers of such reports decline.

Curiously, given what has just been stated, the percentage of cases in which police were regarded by victims as sympathetic or helpful declined only slightly between 1997 and 1998, from 56% to 53%. Most of the increases in police-instigated verbal and physical abuse was actually drawn from a substantial reduction in the percentage of cases in which police had been reported as indifferent: 34% in 1997 versus 27% in 1998. It would appear, then, that indifference hardened to hostility in many police precincts throughout the nation.
PART 3. NATIONAL RECOMMENDATIONS

The problems and concerns documented in Part 2 of this report are not the result of any isolated act of omission by government, society or both. They are representative of a far deeper kind of malady in the nation, one made all the more virulent by its stubborn refusal to recognize it is sick.

The hatred of difference, it may be argued, is an unavoidable if often undesirable part of human nature. Such hatred probably can not nor should not be legislated away. Further, so long as this hatred can effectively masquerade as religious doctrine and moral righteousness, it will perhaps never be clearly and universally recognized for its true content.

Violence resulting from that hatred, however, is and always will be wrong in a nation founded on the rule of law and an oft-quoted respect for human equality. It is unacceptable whether officially sanctioned or private, if it occurs with words or with blows; or if it recognized in some cases but not in others. It is especially wrong—and attains to the level of a deep and fundamental flaw—if it is all of these things at the same time, for then it is general, unrelieved and pernicious.

The recommendations that follow suggest ways that our nation can begin to fashion a genuine and more united remedy to the epidemic of anti-gay violence.

Recommendation 1

Foster a public, educational, political and cultural climate that makes clear that acts of anti-gay hatred and bias can have no part in a civil society. Specifically, schools should design and adopt general tolerance education curricula for youth; political leaders of every party should speak out forcefully against anti-gay discrimination and violence (and support genuine efforts to end it); businesses should establish and enforce appropriate LGBT tolerance and anti-discrimination standards for the workplace; religious leaders should make clear that no religious tradition holds violence against any group to be an acceptable tenet; and the media should explain and report about anti-gay violence in its larger context; i.e., as a broader pattern of occurrence that reflects and causes harm to every individual.

As those who oppose tolerance and social equality for LGBT individuals repeatedly make clear, the nation is in the midst of a “cultural war.” The actual casualties, unfortunately, appear predominantly to be on just one side. It should not need noting that debate is healthy in an open society; “war” of any kind is not. The mainstream of the American people—including its religious, political, business and media leaders—have it within their power to bring an end to the conditions that underlie the epidemic of violence against LGBT individuals merely by drawing the nation’s better instincts and conscience to the extent of the prob-
lem. The LGBT community as a whole, and especially its representatives who helped frame this report, stand ready to help them do so.

Recommendation 2
Commission a national study, as well as substantial independent ancillary research, of anti-gay and other hate-motivated violence, its prevalence and outcomes, and mandate participation in gathering and reporting relevant data by every political jurisdiction, down to the county level. Support the provision of, and include analyses of data from, community organizations that investigate and address related problems.

The current, voluntary system of reporting by states and localities of hate-motivated crimes to the FBI is a poor substitute for a truly comprehensive national hate crimes reporting and tracking effort. Work to address hate crimes cannot succeed so long as so little is known about their extent, perpetrators, victims and related outcomes. At the very least, community-based and other non-governmental groups can and should provide valuable additional data to be considered in any national study or its conclusions.

Recommendation 3
Criminalize hate-motivated behavior against LGBT individuals in the context of federal legislation, and authorize the Attorney General of the United States to investigate and prosecute such cases to the fullest extent.

In 18 states in the country, lesbians and gay men are not included in the categories of individuals who are recognized targets of hate crimes; 11 states have no hate crimes legislation at all. A truly national response to the problem of anti-gay violence entails the enactment of legislation, such as the Hate Crimes Prevention Act, that would permit the FBI and federal prosecutors to intervene when local authorities fail.

Recommendation 4
Further penalize violence against lesbians, gay men and other targets of hate crimes at the state level by passing hate crimes bills to deter such acts and to provide stiffer penalties for those who commit them. To encourage these new laws, the federal government should enact legislation to provide enhanced law enforcement and criminal justice funding to the states that pass them.

Many states decline to pass hate crimes bills on the ostensible grounds that doing so would cause significant increases in costs for law enforcement, criminal prosecutions, incarceration, etc. The federal government should remove these obstacles by providing enhanced funding to states that make fighting hate crimes a higher criminal justice priority.

Recommendation 5
Fund LGBT community-based anti-violence organizations, and other work at the community level, to deter acts of violence against LGBT individuals and to help these agencies build cooperative relationships with a wider range of partners.
LGBT anti-violence organizations generally operate with minimal resources. Over the past year, several have been forced to reduce staffing and programs, and even the largest can meet no more than a small portion of the need for their services. Groups combating violence against other classes of individuals generally receive significant government and private philanthropic assistance. It is time for LGBT and other community groups with innovative strategies for preventing or redressing hate-motivated behavior against lesbians and gay men to gain a much broader level of support, as well.

Recommendation 6
Recruit and hire more openly LGBT police officers at all levels of law enforcement. Establish and promote anti-bias units in every metropolitan and state police force. Investigate and prosecute acts of harassment, intimidation and abuse committed by police officers against LGBT individuals.

Police cannot become effective partners with the LGBT community or the nation as a whole in addressing the problem of anti-gay violence until they have taken meaningful steps to become free of it themselves. More openly LGBT police officers, dedicated anti-bias units and high profile investigations of anti-gay police misconduct are important prerequisites to sending the message that LGBT citizens are entitled to the protection and respect of law enforcement officers, too.
PART 4. LOCAL SUMMARIES

The following pages present summaries of local anti-gay violence data and 1997-78 trends as reported by each of the 16 NCAVP member organizations contributing to this report. For more detailed data pertaining to any reporting region, see the tables contained in Supplement 2 of this report.

Readers may also wish to contact the local NCAVP member groups directly. Several of the latter are preparing more comprehensive descriptions of anti-gay violence in their areas, and may be able to provide more useful information.

For convenience's sake, the names and order of the reporting regions given in these pages are as they appear in the top rows of the data tables that have been included in Supplement 2. The actual names of the reporting organizations in that region, as well as relevant contact information, have been placed in the sidebars.
The Central Coast area of California includes much of the Pacific coastal region situated between Los Angeles and San Francisco. Its population is estimated at 368,000 individuals.

This region reported 27 incidents of anti-gay violence in 1998, down from 46 in the prior year. The incidents in 1998 affected 14 victims, a decrease from the 1997 total of 16. There were seven reported offenders in 1998, compared with 25 in the previous year.

In 1998, harassment accounted for a large majority of the incidents that were reported, while discrimination made up the bulk of those in the prior year. Four assaults, one with a weapon, were reported in both years.

All the offenders in 1998, as well as those documented for 1997, were male. In 1998, all were reported to be thirty years old or younger. Virtually all for whom race/ethnicity was known were reported to be white.

Victims reporting incidents in 1998 tended to be slightly older than offenders and less likely to be male. Almost all 1998 victims were lesbian or gay. No victim reported physical injuries.

Seven incidents were reported to police in 1998, the same number as in the prior year. No arrests were made, and none of the 1998 incidents were classified as bias-related (two had been so classified in 1997). There were no documented instances of police abuse.

California has enacted hate crimes legislation inclusive of sexual orientation.
CLEVELAND (OH)

The Cleveland reporting region primarily includes the city itself, although reports are also accepted from its outlying areas. The core service area population is estimated at 492,000 individuals.

Cleveland reported a substantial increase in anti-gay violence in 1998, recording 41 incidents relative to 1997's total of 25. The number of victims rose as well, from 31 to 47, and the reported number of offenders more than quadrupled, from 57 to 232. Most of the increase in the latter category, however, occurred as the result of a handful of massive police raids of LGBT businesses.

The bulk of other 1998 incident increases were noted in the categories of assault, intimidation and harassment, occurring primarily in streets and other public areas. Assaults, most without weapons, rose 120%, from 5 incidents in 1997 to 11 in 1998. Harassment rose by a substantial but lesser percentage, while the increase in intimidation was more modest.

More than 80% of the known offenders in 1998, as well as those documented in 1997, were male. Age and racial/ethnic distribution also remained typical of trends nationally. For the reasons just noted, there was a very large increase in the number of offenders who were reported to be police officers.

Slightly less than one quarter of the 1998 victims were female, and the proportion of female victims overall rose substantially between the two years. Three of 1998's victims were transgender individuals (up from just one in 1997), and the remainder were male. The overwhelming majority of victims described themselves in both years as lesbian or gay. Most in 1998 were white; about 20% were African-American. Minor injuries occurred to ten victims; serious injuries to two.

Ohio has enacted hate crimes legislation, but it is not inclusive of sexual orientation.
COLORADO

The Colorado reporting region includes the entire state. Its estimated population is 2,100,000 individuals.

In 1998, Colorado reported greater than a 100% increase in incidents of anti-gay violence, one of the highest local rates of increase documented in this report. These incidents affected 60 victims and were reported to have been committed by 47 offenders. The equivalent figures for 1997 were just 29 and 27, respectively.

The bulk of 1998 increases occurred in the categories of harassment, which rose 450%, and assaults, which almost doubled. Nearly one third of assaults were reported to involve weapons, although few of the weapon types were documented. There were two murders, and many victims reported incidents of a serial nature.

Three of Colorado’s 1998 incidents were committed by hate groups, compared with none in 1997. A substantial portion of 1998 offenders were also reported to be greater than 30 years old. In addition, while a majority of offenders were reported to be white, substantial numbers as well were reported to be African-American and, to a much lesser extent, Latino.

Gender, sexual identity, age and race/ethnicity profiles of victims in 1998 were comparable to those reported nationally. The rate of injuries experienced by victims was considerably higher than average, although in most instances injuries were reported to be minor.

31 incidents were reported to police in 1998, an increase of almost 400% over the previous year. Nearly two thirds of all complaints were refused, however, and only three resulted in arrest. No 1998 incidents were documented to have been categorized by police as bias-related. There were two reported instances in 1998 of police verbal abuse of victims and three of physical abuse; no such incidents were reported in 1997.

Colorado has enacted hate crimes legislation, but it is not inclusive of sexual orientation.
COLUMBUS (OH)
The Columbus reporting region primarily includes the city. Its estimated population is 635,000 individuals.

Anti-gay incidents reported by Columbus dropped very slightly between 1997 and 1998, from 206 to 199. The number of victims also dropped, from 288 to 271, but the number of reported offenders rose, from 234 to 245.

The reported 1998 distribution of crimes and offenses in Columbus did not differ substantially from 1997's. In both years, a larger proportion of incidents than nationally—about one third—were assaults and attempted assaults. Weapons, especially knives, were involved in a substantial share of them. Harassment, intimidation and an unusually high number of arsons (there were 12 instances of the latter reported in 1998) accounted for most of the remainder of the incident total.

Most reported offenders were male, and about one third were non-white. A very large majority were believed younger than thirty years old. An unusually high number of offenders were categorized as landlords, tenants or neighbors to the victims. Most of the rest were classified as strangers.

Reported victims in Columbus in 1998 were more likely to be female than was the case in the nation as a whole. In most other respects, they did not differ meaningfully from national norms. Injuries were experienced by about one quarter of victims; serious injuries by about half that amount.

53 incidents were reported to police in 1998, compared with 47 in 1997. Most complaints were taken, and resulted in nine arrests. No incidents were reported classified by police as bias-related. There were no reported instances of the abuse of victims by police.

Ohio has enacted hate crimes legislation, but it is not inclusive of sexual orientation.
DETROIT (MI)

The Detroit reporting area primarily includes the city and surrounding regions. Its estimated population is 5,200,000 individuals.

The total number of anti-gay incidents reported in Detroit rose modestly between 1997 and 1998, from 120 to 130. The number of victims rose from 134 to 143, and the number of offenders from 130 to 140.

Almost 40% of all reported 1998 incidents were assaults, of which nearly 60% involved weapons. Significantly more assaults involved weapons in 1998 than in 1997. The majority of other offenses were intimidation and harassment; in both years, instances of the former outnumbered those of the latter. A growing number of incidents between the two years were categorized as police entrapment.

There were four more murders in Detroit in 1998 than in 1997, ranking the city second in the nation with respect to the largest number increase in this category (New York was first, with five).

The great majority of reported offenders were male, and an exceptionally large number were white. Age distribution was more even than was typical for the nation as a whole, presumably because a significant portion of reported offenders were police officers.

The profile of reported victims was typical. In 1998, more suffered injuries than not. Serious injuries were reported in approximately one third of the cases in which injuries occurred.

50 incidents in Detroit were reported by victims to police in 1998, compared with 33 in 1997. Arrests resulted in eleven cases. Five incidents, down from six in 1997, were classified as bias-related. Reported instances of verbal abuse of victims by police officers grew from 4 to 19 between the two years; instances of physical abuse increased from 3 to 10.

Michigan has enacted hate crimes legislation, but it is not inclusive of sexual orientation.
EL PASO (TX)

The El Paso reporting region includes the city and surrounding area. Its estimated population is 665,000 individuals.

The total of reported anti-gay incidents in El Paso rose from 145 to 161 between 1997 and 1998. Victims, however, decreased, from 186 to 131, while offenders also decreased, from 214 to 177.

Approximately 30% of El Paso 1998 incidents involved assault, while harassment accounted for most of the remainder. Assault numbers dropped precipitously from the total recorded in the prior year, 116. About 40% of 1998 assaults involved one or more weapons, primarily bottles, bats and clubs and vehicles. Large percentages occurred in private residences, at schools and on college campuses.

El Paso reported one murder in 1998, compared with none the year before.

Offender profiles were typical, except that a very high percentage (almost 75%) were reported to be Latino. Their victims were also predominantly Latino, although an additional significant percentage were white. More than one third of 1998 victims were female, and 11 were transgender individuals. 44 victims reported injuries in 1998, down from 54 in 1997; the number reporting serious injuries in 1998, however, was double that in the prior year (14 and 7, respectively).

19 of El Paso incidents in 1998 were reported to police, up from 13 the year before. Complaints were refused in 11 instances; arrest resulted in one. Two incidents were classified in 1998 as bias-related. There were one reported instance of verbal and one of physical abuse by police of victims in 1998; no such incidents were reported for 1997.

Texas has not enacted any hate crimes legislation.
HOUSTON (TX)

The Houston reporting area primarily includes the city. Its estimated population is 1,700,000 individuals.

The number of reported anti-gay incidents in Houston declined slightly from 1997 to 1998, from 35 to 31. The number of victims rose from 35 to 37, and the number of offenders almost quadrupled, from 11 to 40.

Assaults and attempted assaults increased from 5 to 25, a rate of growth of 500%. 15 of the assaults/attempted assaults involved weapons. Harassment and intimidation were documented in a substantial number of these and other incident reports, as well. About half of all incidents occurred on public streets, and almost all incidents were perpetrated by strangers.

Houston reported one murder in 1998. It had reported none the year before.

Almost all Houston offenders in 1998 were males, and about half were white. All but six were under thirty years old. Most of those who were not white were Latino (no Latino offenders, by contrast, were reported in 1997).

Victim characteristics were typical of those reported nationally. 20 victims, representing 54% of those reported in 1998, sustained injuries. In seven cases, the injuries were serious. As a result, the rate of serious injury among all victims in Houston for the year was 19%, substantially higher than for the nation as a whole, and much higher than was reported for 1997.

Complaints were filed by victims in 23 instances in 1998, up from just 3 in 1997. Police refused ten of the complaints, and made an arrest in just one. Two incidents were classified by police as bias-related; in ten cases, bias classification was refused. There were reports in 1998 of three instances of verbal abuse by police and five incidents of physical abuse. No such incidents were reported in the year before.

Texas has not enacted any hate crimes legislation.
LOS ANGELES (CA)

The Los Angeles reporting area primarily includes that city alone. Its estimated population is 3,400,000 individuals.

There were 272 reported anti-gay incidents in Houston in 1998, down from a 1997 total of 350. The number of victims declined from 350 to 313, and the number of offenders decreased to 413 from 597.

Approximately one fourth of all 1998 incidents involved assaults, down from approximately one third in the prior year. The percentage of assaults involving weapons also declined, from 46% in 1997 to 39% in 1998. A slightly greater number of weapons were documented, however, in the assaults that occurred. For example, the reported number of incidents involving at least one firearm (and potentially other weapons as well) jumped from 3 to 8.

Intimidation and harassment both declined by percentages larger than the decline in the number of incidents as a whole. The largest number of incidents generally in 1998 occurred in public streets, private residences and workplaces. There was one reported murder in 1998, compared with none in the year before.

Offenders in 1998 were primarily, but by no means exclusively, male, and a majority were reported to be African-American or Latino. Offenders who were reported to be the former increased between the two years. A majority of offenders in 1998 were described as under 30 years old.

An unusually large percentage of 1998 victims, almost 40%, were female (women comprised just 25% in the previous year). Other victim attributes were generally the same as nationally, save that about half were people of color. 74 victims in 1998 reported injuries, down from 84 in 1997; the rate of serious injury among all victims grew from 7% to 8%, less than the average nationally.

89 complaints were filed with police in 1998, the same number as in 1997. Almost all the complaints were taken, but arrests resulted in just 6 cases. The number of bias crime classifications rose slightly, from 13 to 17. Verbal and physical abuse of victims by police was reported in six instances in 1998, compared with three in the year before.

California has enacted hate crimes legislation inclusive of sexual orientation.
The Massachusetts reporting area is centered in Boston, and includes the entire state. Its estimated population is 5,500,000 individuals.

Reported anti-gay incidents in Massachusetts declined from 228 incidents in 1997 to 145 in 1998. Victims dropped from 290 to 174, and offenders from 563 to 281.

43% of 1998 Massachusetts incidents involved assaults, a much higher percentage than the 33% documented in 1997. From 1997 to 1998, from 35 to 31, 28 assault incidents, representing about the same percentage as in the prior year, involved weapons. The number of victims rose from 35 to 37, and the number of offenders almost quadrupled, from 11 to 40. Most of the rest of anti-gay violence in Massachusetts during 1998 was characterized by intimidation and harassment. There were three cases of sexual assault in 1998, up from zero in 1997, and two cases of murder, the same number as in the prior year.

Reported offenders in 1998 were predominantly young white males. A large reduction was noted in the number who were female, as well as those who were under 18, but both may be attributable to the closure of a program that had targeted anti-gay violence among youth. Even greater reductions, for example, were noted in the number of very young victims.

Victims generally were predominantly as in the nation as a whole. Injuries were suffered by them in 33 instances; in 17 of the latter (more than half), these injuries were characterized as serious.

Massachusetts victims attempted to file 69 police complaints, of which nine resulted in arrests. 27 incidents, or about 42% of those reported to police, were classified as bias-related. Police abuse of victims in Massachusetts grew precipitously in 1998, however: there were twelve reported incidents of verbal abuse and four of physical abuse. In 1997, by contrast, there were none of the latter and five of the former.

Massachusetts has enacted hates crimes legislation inclusive of sexual orientation.
MINNESOTA

The Minnesota reporting area includes the entire state. Its estimated population is 2,600,000 individuals.

Minnesota reported a 16% increase in the number of anti-gay incidents between 1997 and 1998, from 288 to 335. The number of victims declined, however, from 371 to 349, while the number of offenders increased to 569 from 523. The decrease in the number of victims, in conjunction with increases in the numbers of incidents and offenders, was attributable to the occurrence of more serial incidents than in the past. Unfortunately, no specific information was furnished from Minnesota to highlight the actual extent of this growth.

92, or approximately 27%, of Minnesota’s 1998 incidents involved assaults, up from 86 in 1997. 41% of 1998 assaults were reported to involve weapons; the percentage in 1997 was 40%. A much higher number of specific weapons were documented in association with incidents in 1998; however, comparisons in this case are inappropriate because Minnesota’s 1997 weapons data were very clearly underreported. As elsewhere, the bulk of incidents also involved intimidation and harassment, either alone or in combination with assault.

One very alarming increase was noted in the number of sexual assaults, from 5 in 1997 to 15 in 1998. Police entrapment incidents also rose, from 14 to 19. There were two murders in each year.

1998 offenders in Minnesota were somewhat more likely to be female than elsewhere. 40 of the offenders overall were law enforcement officers, many of them associated with incidents of entrapment.

A slightly higher than average number of 1998 victims were female. In addition, in 38 cases, victims were reported to be LGBT organizations. Victim profiles otherwise did not differ significantly from national norms. Injuries were suffered by 76 victims in 1998, 26 more than in 1997; in 18 cases, injuries were reported serious, seven more than in 1997.

101 complaints were filed in 1998 by Minnesota victims with police, more than three times as many as in 1997. Almost all complaints were accepted; 18 resulted in arrest. 37 of the reported incidents in 1998 were classified by police as bias-related, up from eight in the year before. Victims reported 11 instances of verbal and six instances of physical abuse by police in 1998, up from one and zero in the year before.

Minnesota has enacted bias crimes legislation inclusive of sexual orientation.
NEW YORK CITY (NY)

The New York City reporting area primarily includes the five boroughs of New York City. Its estimated population is 7,300,000.

There were 616 incidents of anti-gay violence reported in New York City in 1998, down 6% from 1997's total of 658. The number of victims also dropped, from 789 in 1997 to 761 in 1998. Offenders declined from 1,196 to 1,081.

As in 1997, incidents reported in New York in 1998 continued to include a very wide range of crimes and offenses. Assaults were an element in 210 incidents, or 34% of the total. 42% of 1998 assaults/attempted assaults involved weapons, and 23% more weapons were reported in association with incidents overall. Finally, there were a record 10 murders reported in New York in 1998, twice the number in 1997. The amount of this increase, five, was the largest in the country.

Known offenders in New York were distributed throughout almost all age and racial/ethnic categories. A very large majority, however, were males; a significant plurality were white; and a sizable majority (58%) were less than 30 years old. The number of female offenders, however, increased by 12%. Significant increases were noted as well in the number of offenders who were Arab/Middle Eastern.

Victims overall in 1998 were typical of those reported nationally. A large increase (133%, from 15 in 1997 to 35 in 1998) was noted in the number who were transgender individuals. Heterosexual victims increased also, by 30%, and a greater proportion of 1998 victims than in 1997 were less than 30 years old.

Serious injuries to victims rose 36%, from 45 in 1997 to 61 in 1998. A much larger percentage increase (187%) occurred in the number who were hospitalized. Those reported needing, but not receiving, medical care rose 61% (to 29); and those receiving out-patient care rose 9% (to 58).

Complaints to police in 1998 rose 22%, relative to 1997. Most complaints were accepted, and resulted in 80 arrests, significantly more than the 39 reported in the prior year. About one third of incidents reported to police were classified as bias crimes. In 1998, however, a much higher percentage of victims reporting incidents to police said they became further victims of police verbal and/or physical abuse. The increases in these categories (400% and 2,600%) were far higher than the increase in the rate of reporting overall, and affected 63 victims, or more than 21% of those who turned to the police for help.

New York has not enacted any hate crimes legislation.
ORLANDO (FL)

The reporting area of Orlando primarily includes that city. Its estimated population is 1,300,000 individuals.

The number of reported anti-gay incidents in Orlando more than doubled between 1997 and 1998, from seven to 15. The number of victims increased from 16 to 32, and the number of offenders from 24 to 50.

More than half (18) of 1998 incidents were assaults, a very large percentage (72%) of which involved weapons. Harassment and intimidation accounted for almost all other incidents. There were two reported abductions/kidnappings in 1998 (none were reported in 1997). There were also three murders.

Documented offenders were primarily male, under the age of 30 and overwhelmingly white. Most were strangers to their victims, and a sizable majority (59%) acted alone.

Victims were typical of those reported nationally, save that almost all were white. Seven sustained injuries in 1998, two more than in 1997. Serious injuries were documented in three of the 1998 cases; no serious injuries occurred in the year before.

Police reports were filed by 19 victims in 1998, eight more than in the year before. All but three of the 1998 complaints were accepted; four resulted in arrest. Bias classification was made available in three instances. No instances of police abuse of victims were documented in either year.

Florida has enacted hate crimes legislation inclusive of sexual orientation.
PROVIDENCE (RI)

The Providence reporting region primarily includes that city, but also monitors reports from the entire state of Rhode Island. The estimated population of the core reporting area is 160,000 individuals.

The reported number of anti-gay incidents occurring in Providence rose to 14 in 1998, from 1997’s total of 11. Victims also rose from 11 to 14. The number of reported offenders, however, rose much more steeply, from 9 to 34. This rise was primarily attributable to the fast increasing prevalence of anti-LGBT violence initiated by groups of two-three individuals (there were 10 such incidents reported in 1998, and none in 1997). There were no murders reported for either year.

Half of the anti-gay incidents documented in Providence in 1998 were assaults, two of which involved weapons. Harassment, intimidation and four reported incidents of police entrapment accounted for almost all of the remainder.

Most information about offenders in Providence was not well-documented. All, however, were reported to be male, and all but one of them white.

All 1998 Providence victims were reported to be male, as well. In most other respects they were typical of victims reported nationally. Seven victims reported injuries; in two instances, these injuries were serious.

Just two incidents were reported by victims to police in 1998— an increase of one over the number reported in 1997. Both 1998 complaints were accepted but did not result any arrests. Both were classified by police as bias-related, compared with none in the prior year. No reports were received from victims of police verbal or physical abuse.

Rhode Island has enacted hate crimes legislation inclusive of sexual orientation.
ST. LOUIS (MO)

The St. Louis reporting area primarily includes that city. Its estimated population is 368,000.

The total number of anti-gay incidents reported in St. Louis rose slightly, from 51 in 1997 to 56 in 1998, a 10% increase. The reported number of victims nonetheless fell from 72 to 68, and the number of offenders from 97 to 88.

The primary factor contributing to these anomalous results was a significant increase in the occurrence of serial incidents between the two years. Incidents in which perpetrator(s) had committed 2-5 previous incidents against the same victim(s) increased 80%, from 10 to 18. Those in which the perpetrator(s) had acted against the same victim(s) in ten or more previous incidents rose 66%, from 3 to 5. In all, serial incidents comprised 41% of 1998 reported cases.

Most of the content of anti-gay violence in St. Louis in 1998 continued to be characterized by intimidation and harassment. Assault was a component in just 18% of incidents overall, down from 22% in 1997. A striking exception was the occurrence of two murders in 1998; there were none in 1997.

Offender characteristics were comparable to those reported nationally. Victims were somewhat more likely to be female than in many other of the reporting regions, but were otherwise also fairly typical. Injuries were experienced by relatively few victims in 1998.

64% more victims in St. Louis filed police reports in 1998 than in 1997, for a 1998 total of 23. Almost all of the complaints were accepted, but only one resulted in arrest. Just one complaint, too, was eventually classified as bias-related. There were two reported instances of police verbal abuse of victims, and none of physical abuse.

Missouri has enacted hate crime legislation, but it is not inclusive of sexual orientation.
The San Diego reporting area primarily includes that city. Its estimated population is 1,200,000.

There were 38 reported incidents of anti-gay violence in San Diego in 1998. This figure represents a 17% reduction from the 46 incidents reported in 1997. The number of victims also declined between the two years, from 61 to 48, and the number of offenders dropped by more half, from 139 to 68.

Anti-gay incidents in San Diego during 1998 were characterized primarily by ten assaults, six of which involved weapons, and numerous occurrences of intimidation and harassment. There was one murder in 1998; in 1997, there were none.

1998 offenders resembled national norms. The characteristics of victims were also not unusual, save that comparably few of them suffered any injuries. Just one victim reported serious injuries in 1998; however, no such reports were made in 1997.

Police reports were filed in 18 cases in 1998, up from 13 in 1997. Nearly all the complaints were taken, but resulted in just one arrest. Two incidents were classified by police as bias-related. There were no reports of police verbal or physical abuse in 1998, as was also true for 1997.

California has enacted hate crimes legislation inclusive of sexual orientation.
SAN FRANCISCO (CA)

The San Francisco reporting area primarily includes that city. Its estimated population is 730,000.

The total number of reported anti-gay incidents in San Francisco decreased slightly, from 402 in 1997 to 395 in 1998, for a percentage decline of 2%. The number of victims decreased at a higher rate, from 517 to 434, while the number of offenders dropped from 651 to 548.

Almost precisely half of reported incidents in San Francisco during 1998 were assaults or attempted assaults, compared with 46% the year before. 47, or approximately 12% of all incidents, involved weapons. The remainder of 1998 incidents were comprised primarily of intimidation and harassment. One substantial increase was noted between 1997 and 1998 in the number of sexual assaults, which climbed from 10 to 18. Two incidents—one more than in 1997—were murders.

With respect to offenders, reports from San Francisco were fairly consistent with ones from other parts of the country. An exception was their age distribution; the largest number of offenders fell into the 30-44 year old category. A fairly large number were also reported to be landlords, tenants or neighbors to their victims. About half were white, and most of the remainder were divided more or less evenly between Latino and African-American individuals.

Victims of anti-gay violence in San Francisco during 1998 were notable mainly for the inclusion of a large (and growing, compared to 1997 figures) number of transgender individuals, who accounted for almost 9% of the total. San Francisco also reported a larger number of victims than elsewhere who were Asian/Pacific Islander individuals.

Serious injuries were reported by 66 victims in 1998, and minor injuries by 111. Both figures are less than their 1997 totals, although the decline in serious injuries was so small as almost to be insignificant.

Police reports were filed in 178 of 1998's cases, representing about the same percentage as in 1997. 127 of the incidents they described, or fully 71%, were recognized and classified by police as being bias crimes. Arrests were made in 32 instances, for a rate of apprehension of 18%.

Despite these relatively high rates of bias classification and offender arrest, police abuse of victims in San Francisco rose during the year. Nine instances of police verbal abuse and four of physical abuse were reported in 1998, compared with seven and none, respectively, in 1997.

California has enacted hate crimes legislation inclusive of sexual orientation.
The following pages reproduce the Case Intake/Incident Tracking Form employed by NCAVP reporting agencies to record raw incident data.
SUPPLEMENT 2
Comprehensive Data

The following pages reproduce the aggregate raw incident data for 1997 and 1998 reported to NCAVP by the 16 participating member agencies. All data were drawn originally from individual copies of the Case Intake/Incident Tracking form reproduced in Supplement 1.